

Telemonitoring and Telerehabilitation Can Improve of Health Status for Heart Failure? A Review

Eza Kemal Firdaus¹, Indri Wijayanti², Purwatiningsih³^{1,2} *Anesthesiology Nursing Department, Universitas Harapan Bangsa, 53182, Indonesia*³ *Department of Nursing, Universitas Harapan Bangsa, 53182, Indonesia*

ARTICLE INFO

Article history:

Received December 21, 2022

Revised January 13, 2023

Published January 25, 2023

Keywords:

Heart Failure;
Cardiac Failure;
Telerehabilitation;
Telemonitoring;
Health Status;

ABSTRACT

This review aims to enhance the health status of patients with heart failure, this review will look into the possibilities of telemonitoring and telerehabilitation as a nursing care delivery paradigm. "Reviews of the literature are focused on problems, approaches, formulas, and suggestions for additional research. PUBMED, SAGE Journal, Wiley Online Library, Proquest, and ScienceDirect were all used to conduct extensive research on the subject. Among the telemonitoring and telerehabilitation methods found in the treatment of heart failure patients were websites, phone calls, and applications." Telemonitoring and telerehabilitation can decrease rehospitalization and mortality in heart failure patients while enhancing health status, self-care, self-efficacy, clinical management, and education.

This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/)

Corresponding Author:

Eza Kemal Firdaus, Universitas Harapan Bangsa, Purwokerto, 53182, Indonesia

Email: ezakemal@uhb.ac.id

1. INTRODUCTION

Heart failure is a very deadly and complex disease characterized by a decrease in the heart's ability to pump blood to meet the body's need for oxygen [1]. "Although therapy and prevention have made rapid progress, the mortality and morbidity rates in patients with heart failure are still very high and the quality of life of patients is still low. An estimated 41 million people died worldwide in 2016 with the equivalent of 71% of the deaths caused by heart disease (17.9 million) [2]. "Heart disease is still the highest contributor to death worldwide; it is predicted that it will continue to increase until 2030 [2][3].

The medical goals of heart failure treatment only focus on controlling so that symptoms do not get worse [4], reduce length of stay and to maintain continuity of life, do not provide guarantees for rehospitalization patients or even improve their quality of life [5]. Heart failure patients also cannot do excessive activities but still have to do light physical exercise [6], lose weight to make it ideal [7], adhere to recommended medication [8], be given support to keep the spirit to recover [9], and must be able to do self-care [10]. So to monitor the patient's condition, one of the right choices in improving the health status of heart failure patients is by doing telemonitoring and telerehabilitation [11].

Telerehabilitation is the "provision of rehabilitation services at a distance through information and telecommunications technology [12], such as telephone [13], internet [14], or video conferencing [15] that are carried out at the patient's home as an effective and safe complementary alternative in improving the quality of life [16]. "Telerehabilitation can help improve accessibility for people with heart failure starting from regular supervised physical exercise [17], "educational programs related to conditions experienced [18], increasing exercise adherence and lifestyle modifications [19], increasing adherence to taking medication [20], saving

costs [21], and reducing utilization of health facility services [22], as well as giving feedback every week regarding the condition of the patient's status [23].

2. REVIEW METHODS

2.1. Research Design

The research was conducted using a systematic review method that examines various research reports published in journals with the same focus.

2.2. Identification Problem

The practice of recognizing or listing problems is known as problem identification. “The research problem is important compared to other processes since it affects how well the research is done. Finding the search terms or keywords utilized in the literature research is beneficial when formulating problems.

2.3. Searching The Literature

Articles were searched using the PUBMED, SAGE Journal, Wiley Online Library, Proquest, and ScienceDirect databases with PRISMA Flow Diagram technique. The formulation of the search strategy includes inclusion and exclusion of criteria, keywords, and selection of research reports. The keywords used were “Heart Failure OR Cardiac Failure AND Telerehabilitation OR Telemonitoring AND Health Status”.

2.4. Eligibility Criteria

The criteria in this study is based on the PICO framework criteria:

- Patient: Heart Failure OR Cardiac Failure
- Intervention: Telerehabilitation OR Telemonitoring
- Comparison: No comparison
- Outcome: Health Status

Apart from that, the admission requirements are already pre-determined. Only multiple publications that have been accepted for publication or have been published in peer-reviewed journals are considered. Tables have been taken into account. All publications are evaluated, including opinions, perspectives, original research and reviews, without geographical, temporal or language restrictions.

3. DISCUSSION

Application of Telemonitoring and telerehabilitation is able to improve the quality of life of patients as seen from the significant differences in values before and after the implementation of the intervention [24], besides that this application is also able to improve health status [25], self care [26], self efficacy [27], clinical management [28], and educational as well as reduce rehospitalization and mortality in heart failure patients [29]. This mobile-based telemonitoring and telerehabilitation provides evidence in improving quality of life [30], clinical management [31], psychosocial status [32] and preventing rehospitalization [33]. The use of a cellphone-based system has a high level of compliance and is appropriate for patients [34] because cellphones have become a primary need for the community [35] so that this program can be used as an important additional program for health services for patients with heart failure in improving health status [36]. With a simple and intensive education [37] and self-care promotion strategy [38], this telerehabilitation program has proven to be effective and can be applied to a wider population around the world [39].

“The technology enables programmed modifications to furosemide depending on changes in each patient's body weight and can communicate with a robotic platform [40] This approach is integrally linked to selective, nurse-led, organized telephone assistance for a fraction of hospitalized patients who exhibit certain warning signs [41], such as nocturnal symptoms, medication non-adherence, or poor SMS response [42]. Patients also had the option to change the degree of the remote monitoring technique after 30 days, reducing the quantity of messages if they thought it was unreasonable to demand such stringent monitoring more [43]. This was another individualized and tailored feature of the intervention. With little human-computer interaction, this thorough and diverse strategy enabled a significant number of participants (weight and clinically stable patients adhering to recommended prescription therapy) [44]. We think that the nature of this interaction, particularly in some patients at a sensitive stage of the heart failure syndrome [45], is most likely to translate into meaningful clinical benefit because the necessary technical foundation is straightforward and

self-teachable [46]. Finally, if the approach is successful, it might be readily adopted to a larger population worldwide. The implementation of telemonitoring and telerehabilitation increased the respondents' quality of life, according to the findings of the health status analysis [47].

"People can gain a better understanding of their health through telemonitoring or telerehabilitation, i.e. Enhanced surveillance as a placebo effect. Nurses frequently call patients who are being remotely monitored to discuss the results and advise them to repeat the test if the results are abnormal [48]. Increasing patient engagement with nurses and structured patient self-monitoring are likely what caused the effect, despite the fact that nurses were given instructions and tools to educate their patients, regardless of group [49]. Participation in hospital programs that use remote monitoring improves perceived health, including quality of life, whether the health benefits come from increased human contact or remote monitoring [50]. Remote monitoring was independently linked to an improved health status in regression models. Additionally, it was independently proven that Home Health Care (HHC) facilities with specialized Heart Failure programs had better medical results for patients [51]. This most likely reflects an increase in staff specialization and proficiency, both of which are acknowledged as being essential in the multidisciplinary approach to Heart Failure [52]. Telemonitoring and telerehabilitation might not be as successful without a team of specialists with a variety of skills. It is noteworthy that despite lower incident rates regardless of the randomization group, this agency provided fewer HHC visits. This organization reduced HHC visits while also enhancing patient outcomes. Telemonitoring is thought to be highly effective in preventing illness because it enables patients to receive early care. Telerehabilitation provided collaborative support through a nurse and other medical professionals rather than focusing solely on vital signs. Therefore, it seems that the benefit of telemonitoring comes from direct interaction with medical professionals who can plan and provide patients with comprehensive treatment [53].

4. CONCLUSION

The telemonitoring system provided quick automated assistance and allowed for professional involvement at the most advantageous time, or "teachable moments," to help patients change their lifestyle choices. For instance, numerous individuals found that their weight and blood pressure rose after eating a meal high in sodium. They would eat less salt at the succeeding meals, which would lead to a recovery of their weight and blood pressure to normal. Automatic reminders to take additional diuretic medication in response to weight gain were sent to certain patients, which further supported their decision to do so. Although the cardiologist had previously advised this particular group of patients to take additional diuretic medication in this situation, they were frequently reluctant to do so without first getting permission.

5. LIMITATION

Heart failure telemonitoring and telerehabilitation was intended to reduce hospitalization and increase patient self-care, but it had not been well applied. Lack of medical resources or protocols led to the consideration of the variables. Therefore, further investigation is needed to determine which patients are appropriate candidates for telemonitoring and to determine the optimum protocol in light of the therapeutic indications.

REFERENCES

- [1] Smeltzer SC, Bare BG. Medical Surgical Nursing. 2010. Jakarta :EGC
- [2] WHO. *World Health Statistics 2020 (Monitoring Health For The SDGs)*. 2020. <https://apps.who.int/>.
- [3] WHO. *World Health Statistics 2021 (Monitoring Health For The SDGs)*. 2021 <https://apps.who.int/>.
- [4] Rohde LE, Hoffmann FCR, Rover MM, Rabelo-Silva ER, Lopez L, Passos LCS, Silvestre OM, Martins SM, de Figueiredo Neto JA, Silveira FS, Canesin MF, Simões MV, Akio NF, Bertoldi EG, Danzmann LC, Mourilhe-Rocha R, Magedanz EH, Esteves M, de Castilho FM, ... Ramirez F. Design of a multifaceted strategy based on automated text messaging in patients with recent heart failure admission. *ESC Heart Failure*. 2021; 8(6), 5523–5530. 10.1002/ehf2.13516
- [5] Seto E, Leonard, KJ, Cafazzo JA, Barnsley J, Masino C, Ross HJ. Mobile phone-based telemonitoring for heart failure management: A randomized controlled trial. *Journal of Medical Internet Research*. 2012; 14(1). 10.2196/jmir.1909
- [6] Madigan E, Schmotzer BJ, Struk CJ, DiCarlo CM, Kikano G, Piña IL, Boxer RS. Home Health Care With Telemonitoring Improves Health Status for Older Adults With Heart Failure. *Home Health Care Services Quarterly* 2013;32(1), 57–74. 10.1080/01621424.2012.755144

- [7] Mizukawa M, Moriyama M, Yamamoto H, Rahman M, Naka M, Kitagawa T, Kobayashi S, Oda N, Yasunobu Y, Tomiyama M, Morishima N, Matsuda K, Kihara Y. Nurse-led collaborative management using telemonitoring improves the quality of life and prevention of rehospitalization in patients with heart failure in a pilot study. *International Heart Journal*. 2019;60(6), 1293–1302. 10.1536/ihj.19-313
- [8] Ong MK, Romano PS, Edgington S, Aronow HU, Auerbach AD, Black JT, de Marco T, Escarce JJ, Evangelista LS, Hanna B, Ganiats TG, Greenberg BH, Greenfield S, Kaplan SH, Kimchi A, Liu H, Lombardo D, Mangione CM, Sadeghi B, ... Yan T. The effectiveness of remote patient monitoring after discharge of hospitalized patients with heart failure is better after transition-heart failure (BEAT-HF) randomized clinical trial. *JAMA Internal Medicine*. 2016;176(3), 310–318. 10.1001/jamainternmed.2015.7712
- [9] Brouwers RWM, van Exel HJ, van Hal JMC, Jorstad HT, de Kluiver EP, Kraaijenhagen RA, Kuijpers PMJC, van der Linde MR, Spee RF, Sunamura M, Uszko-Lencer, NHMK, Vromen T, Wittekoek ME, Kemps HMC. Cardiac telerehabilitation as an alternative to center-based cardiac rehabilitation. *Netherlands Heart Journal*. 2020;28(9), 443–451. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12471-020-01432-y>
- [10] Cavalheiro AH, Silva Cardoso J, Rocha A, Moreira E, Azevedo LF. Effectiveness of Tele-rehabilitation Programs in Heart Failure: A Systematic Review and Meta-analysis. *Health Services Insights*. 2021;14. 10.1177/11786329211021668.
- [11] Clark RA, Inglis SC, McAlister FA, Cleland JG, Stewart S. Telemonitoring or structured telephone support programmes for patients with chronic heart failure: systematic review and meta-analysis. *BMJ*. 2007(5);334(7600):942. 10.1136/bmj.39156.536968.55.
- [12] Polisen J, Tran K, Cimon K, Hutton B, McGill S, Palmer K, et al. Home telemonitoring for congestive heart failure: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *J Telemed Telecare* 2010;16(2):68-76. 10.1258/jtt.2009.090406
- [13] Koehler F, Winkler S, Schieber M, Sechtem U, Stangl K, Böhm M, Telemedical Interventional Monitoring in Heart Failure Investigators. Impact of remote telemedical management on mortality and hospitalizations in ambulatory patients with chronic heart failure: the telemedical interventional monitoring in heart failure study. *Circulation* 2011(3);123(17):1873-1880. 10.1161/CIRCULATIONAHA.111.018473
- [14] Scherr D, Kastner P, Kollmann A, Hallas A, Auer J, Krappinger H, MOBITEL Investigators. Effect of home-based telemonitoring using mobile phone technology on the outcome of heart failure patients after an episode of acute decompensation: randomized controlled trial. *J Med Internet Res* 2009;11(3):e34. 10.2196/jmir.1252
- [15] Bowles KH, Holland DE, Horowitz DA. A comparison of in-person home care, home care with telephone contact and home care with telemonitoring for disease management. *J Telemed Telecare* 2009;15(7):344-350. 10.1258/jtt.2009.090118.
- [16] Yale New Haven Health Services Corporation/Center for Outcomes Research and Evaluation. 2013 Measures Updates and Specifications Report: Hospital-Level 30-Day Risk-Standardized Readmission Measures for Acute Myocardial Infarction, Heart Failure, and Pneumonia (Version 6.0). New Haven, CT.
- [17] Naylor MD, Broton D, Campbell R, et al. Comprehensive discharge planning and home follow-up of hospitalized elders: a randomized clinical trial. *JAMA*. 1999; 281(7):613–620.
- [18] Inglis SC, Clark RA, Dierckx R, Prieto-Merino D, Cleland JG. Structured telephone support or non-invasive telemonitoring for patients with heart failure. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*. 2015; (10):CD007228.
- [19] Pandor A, Gomersall T, Stevens JW, et al. Remote monitoring after recent hospital discharge in patients with heart failure: a systematic review and network meta-analysis. *Heart*. 2013; 99(23):1717–1726.
- [20] Pandor A, Thokala P, Gomersall T, et al. Home telemonitoring or structured telephone support programmes after recent discharge in patients with heart failure: systematic review and economic evaluation. *Health Technol Assess*. 2013; 17(32):1–207. v–vi.
- [21] Black JT, Romano PS, Sadeghi B, et al. BEAT-HF Research Group. A remote monitoring and telephone nurse coaching intervention to reduce readmissions among patients with heart failure: study protocol for the Better Effectiveness After Transition–Heart Failure (BEAT-HF) randomized controlled trial. *Trials*. 2014; 15:124.
- [22] DeWalt DA, Malone RM, Bryant ME, et al. A heart failure self-management program for patients of all literacy levels: a randomized, controlled trial. *BMC Health Serv Res*. 2006; 6:30.
- [23] Howie-Esquivel J, Carroll M, Brinker E, et al. A strategy to reduce heart failure readmissions and inpatient costs. *Cardiol Res*. 2015; 6(1):201–208. 10.14740/cr384w.
- [24] White M, Garbez R, Carroll M, Brinker E, Howie-Esquivel J. Is “teach-back” associated with knowledge retention and hospital readmission in hospitalized heart failure patients? *J Cardiovasc Nurs*. 2013; 28(2):137–146.
- [25] Desai AS, Stevenson LW. Connecting the circle from home to heart-failure disease management. *N Engl J Med*. 2010; 363(24):2364–2367.

- [26] Zile MR, Bennett TD, St John Sutton M, et al. Transition from chronic compensated to acute decompensated heart failure: pathophysiological insights obtained from continuous monitoring of intracardiac pressures. *Circulation*. 2008; 118(14):1433–1441.
- [27] Barnett ML, Hsu J, McWilliams JM. Patient characteristics and differences in hospital readmission rates. *JAMA Intern Med*. 2015; 175(11):1803–1812.
- [28] Chan PS, Soto G, Jones PG, Nallamothu BK, Zhang Z, Weintraub WS, Spertus JA. Patient health status and costs in heart failure: insights from the eplerenone post-acute myocardial infarction heart failure efficacy and survival study (EPHESUS). *Circulation*. 2009; 119(3):398–407. Comparative Study Multicenter Study Randomized Controlled Trial. 10.1161/CIRCULATIONAHA.108.820472.
- [29] Chaudhry SI, Matterna JA, Curtis JP, Spertus JA, Herrin J, Lin Z, Krumholz HM. Telemonitoring in Patients with Heart Failure. *N Engl J Med*. 363(24):2301–2309.10.1056/NEJMoa1010029
- [30] Dar O, Riley J, Chapman C, Dubrey SW, Morris S, Rosen SD, Cowie MR. A randomized trial of home telemonitoring in a typical elderly heart failure population in North West London: results of the Home-HF study. *Eur J Heart Fail*. 2009; 11(3):319–325. 10.1093/eurjhf/hfn050
- [31] Gellis ZD, Kenaley B, McGinty J, Bardelli E, Davitt J, Ten Have T. Outcomes of a Telehealth Intervention for Homebound Older Adults With Heart or Chronic Respiratory Failure: A Randomized Controlled Trial. *Gerontologist*. 2012.10.1093/geront/gnr134
- [32] Goldberg LR, Piette JD, Walsh MN, Frank TA, Jaski BE, Smith AL, Investigators W. Randomized trial of a daily electronic home monitoring system in patients with advanced heart failure: the Weight Monitoring in Heart Failure (WHARF) trial. *Am Heart J*. 2003; 146(4):705–712. 10.1016/S0002-8703(03)00393-4S0002870303003934
- [33] Klersy C, De Silvestri A, Gabutti G, Regoli F, Auricchio A. A meta-analysis of remote monitoring of heart failure patients. *J Am Coll Cardiol*. 2009; 54(18):1683–1694. S0735-1097(09)02921-0. 10.1016/j.jacc.2009.08.017
- [34] Madigan EA. People with heart failure and home health care resource use and outcomes. *J Clin Nurs*. 2008; 17(7B):253–259. JCN2334. 10.1111/j.1365-2702.2008.02334.x
- [35] Saczynski JS, Darling CE, Spencer FA, Lessard D, Gore JM, Goldberg RJ. Clinical Features, Treatment Practices, and Hospital and Long-Term Outcomes of Older Patients Hospitalized with Decompensated Heart Failure: The Worcester Heart Failure Study. *J Am Geriatr Soc*. 2009
- [36] Schwarz KA, Mion LC, Hudock D, Litman G. Telemonitoring of heart failure patients and their caregivers: a pilot randomized controlled trial. *Prog Cardiovasc Nurs*. 2008; 23(1):18–26.
- [37] Soran OZ, Pina IL, Lamas GA, Kelsey SF, Selzer F, Pilote J, Feldman AM. A randomized clinical trial of the clinical effects of enhanced heart failure monitoring using a computer-based telephonic monitoring system in older minorities and women. *J Card Fail*. 2008; 14(9):711–717. S1071-9164(08)00594-0. 10.1016/j.cardfail.2008.06.448.
- [38] Spertus J, Peterson E, Conard MW, Heidenreich PA, Krumholz HM, Jones P. Cardiovascular Outcomes Research, C. Monitoring clinical changes in patients with heart failure: a comparison of methods. *Am Heart J*. 2005; 150(4):707–715. S0002-8703(04)00906-8. 10.1016/j.ahj.2004.12.010
- [39] Anker S, Koehler F, Abraham W. Telemedicine and remote management of patients with heart failure. *Lancet* 2011; **378**: 731–739.
- [40] Morgan JM, Kitt S, Gill J, McComb JM, Ng GA, Raftery J, Roderick P, Seed A, Williams SG, Witte KK, Wright DJ, Harris S, Cowie MR. Remote management of heart failure using implantable electronic devices. *Eur Heart J*. 2017; **38**: 2352–2360.
- [41] Hindricks G, Taborisky M, Glikson M, Heinrich U, Schumacher B, Katz A, Brachmann J, Lewalter T, Goette A, Block M, Kautzner J, Sack S, Husser D, Piorkowski C, Sogaard P, IN-TIME Study Group. Implant-based multiparameter telemonitoring of patients with heart failure (IN-TIME): a randomised controlled trial. *Lancet*. 2014; **384**: 583–590.
- [42] Koehler F, Koehler K, Deckwart O, Prescher S, Wegscheider K, Kirwan BA, Winkler S, Vettorazzi E, Bruch L, Oeff M, Zugck C, Doerr G, Naegele H, Störk S, Butter C, Sechtem U, Angermann C, Gola G, Prondzinsky R, Edelmann F, Spethmann S, Schellong SM, Schulze PC, Bauersachs J, Wellge B, Schoebel C, Tajsic M, Dreger H, Anker SD, Stangl K. Efficacy of telemedical interventional management in patients with heart failure (TIM-HF2): a randomised, controlled, parallel-group, unmasked trial. *Lancet* 2018; **392**: 1047–1057.
- [43] Fischer HH, Moore SL, Ginosar D, Davidson AJ, Rice-Peterson CM, Durfee MJ, MacKenzie TD, Estacio RO, Steele AW. Care by cell phone: text messaging for chronic disease management. *Am J Manag Care* 2012; **18**: e42–e47.
- [44] Chen C, Li X, Sun L, Cao S, Kang Y, Hong L, Liang Y, You G, Zhang Q. Post-discharge short message service improves short-term clinical outcome and self-care behaviour in chronic heart failure. *ESC Hear Fail* 2019; **6**: 164–173.

-
- [45] Desai AS. Home monitoring heart failure care does not improve patient outcomes: looking beyond telephone-based disease management. 2012; 125: 828-36
- [46] Bashi N, Karunanithi M, Fatehi F, Ding H, Walters D. Remote monitoring of patients with heart failure: an overview of systematic reviews. *J Med.* 2017; 19: e18.
- [47] Kitsiou S, Paré G, Jaana M. Effects of home telemonitoring interventions on patients with chronic heart failure: an overview of systematic reviews. *J Med.* 2015; 7: e63.
- [48] Koehler F, Winkler S, Schieber M, *et al.* Impact of remote telemedical management on mortality and hospitalizations in ambulatory patients with chronic heart failure: the telemedical interventional monitoring in heart failure study. 2011; 123: 1873-80.
- [49] Kotooka N, Kitakaze M, Nagashima K, *et al.* The first multicenter, randomized, controlled trial of home telemonitoring for Japanese patients with heart failure: home telemonitoring study for patients with heart failure (HOMES-HF). *Heart Vessels* 2018; 33: 866-76.
- [50] Boyne JJ, Vrijhoef HJ. Implementing telemonitoring in heart failure care: barriers from the perspectives of patients, healthcare professionals and healthcare organizations. *Curr Heart Fail.* 2013; 10: 254-61.
- [51] Riley JP, Gabe JP, Cowie MR. Does telemonitoring in heart failure empower patients for self-care? A qualitative study. *J Clin Nurs.* 2013; 22: 2444-55.
- [52] Koehler F, Winkler S, Schieber M, *et al.* Telemedicine in heart failure: pre-specified and exploratory subgroup analyses from the TIM-HF trial. *Int J Cardiol.* 2012; 161: 143-50.
- [53] Kato N, Johansson P, Okada I, *et al.* Heart failure telemonitoring in Japan and Sweden: A cross-sectional survey. *J Med.* 2015; 17: e258.